

references

|   |  |
|---|--|
| SA = Simulated Annealing<br>PBIL = Population Based Incremental Learning  | from Ventresca, M., 2012. Global search algorithms using a combinatorial unranking-based problem representation for the critical node detection problem. <i>Computers &amp; Operations Research</i> 39, 2763–2775.   |
| DFSH-Post = Depth First Search Heuristic with Postprocessing  | Edalatmanesh, M., 2013. Heuristics for the critical node detection problem in large complex networks. Ph.D. thesis, Faculty of Mathematics and Science, Brock University, St. Catharines, Ontario.   |
| Greedy = greedy algorithm   | Ventresca, M., Aleman, D., 2015a. Efficiently identifying critical nodes in large complex networks. <i>Computational Social Networks</i> 2 (6).  |
| Greedy3d and Greedy4d = constructive algorithms   | Addis, B., Aringhieri, R., Grosso, A., Hosteins, P., 2016. Hybrid Constructive Heuristics for the Critical Node Problem. <i>Annals of Operations Research</i> 238 (1), 637–649.  |
| Best VNS = Best VNS algorithm among all existing VNS variants<br>Best among all VNS = best result for each instance among all 24 VNS variants<br>Best ILS = Best ILS algorithm among all existing ILS variants<br>Best among all ILS = best result for each instance among all 6 ILS variants | Aringhieri, R., Grosso, A., Hosteins, P., Scatamacchia, R., 2016. Local search metaheuristics for the critical node problem. <i>Networks</i> 67, 209–221.  |
| Genetic = genetic algorithm with use of greedy rules  | R. Aringhieri, A. Grosso, and P. Hosteins. A genetic algorithm for a class of critical node problems. In <i>The 7th International Network Optimization Conference (INOC'15)</i> , volume 52 of <i>Electronic Notes in Discrete Mathematics</i> , pages 359-366, 2016<br><br>Aringhieri, R., Grosso, A., Hosteins, P., Scatamacchia, R., 2016. A general evolutionary framework for different classes of critical node problems. <i>Engineering Applications of Artificial Intelligence</i> , 55:128-145, 2016. |
| CNA1 = Critical Node Algorithm 1  | W. Pullan, 2015. Heuristic identification of critical nodes in sparse real-world graphs. <i>Journal of Heuristics</i> 21, 577–598.   |
| GRASP+PR = Greedy Randomized Adaptive Search Procedure with Path Relinking  | D. Purevsuren, G. Cui, N.N.H. Win, X. Wang, 2016. Heuristic Algorithm for Identifying Critical Nodes in Graphs. <i>Advances in Computer Science: an International Journal</i> 5 (3).   |
| exact = exact algorithms (used as target value, when available)   | Veremyev, A., Boginski, V., Pasiliao, E., 2014. Exact identification of critical nodes in sparse networks via new compact formulations. <i>Optimization Letters</i> 8, 1245–1259.<br><br>Di Summa, M., Grosso, A., Locatelli, M., 2012. Branch and cut algorithms for detecting critical nodes in undirected graphs. <i>Computational Optimization and Applications</i> 53, 649–680.   |

| Instances | K   | exact | SA      | PBIL    | DFSH-<br>Post | Greedy  | Greedy3d     | Greedy4d     | Best VNS     | Best<br>among all<br>VNS | Best ILS   | Best<br>among all<br>ILS | Genetic      | CNA1         | GRASP+P<br>R |
|-----------|-----|-------|---------|---------|---------------|---------|--------------|--------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------|--------------------------|--------------|--------------|--------------|
| BA500     | 50  | 195   | 997     | 892     | 203           | 199     | <b>195</b>   | <b>195</b>   | <b>195</b>   | <b>195</b>               | <b>195</b> | <b>195</b>               | <b>195</b>   | <b>195</b>   | <b>195</b>   |
| BA1000    | 75  | 558   | 3770    | 3057    | 580           | 559     | 559          | 559          | 559          | 559                      | 559        | 559                      | <b>558</b>   | <b>558</b>   | <b>558</b>   |
| BA2500    | 100 | 3704  | 31171   | 28044   | 4292          | 3726    | 3722         | 3722         | <b>3704</b>  | <b>3704</b>              | 3722       | 3722                     | <b>3704</b>  | <b>3704</b>  | <b>3704</b>  |
| BA5000    | 150 | 10196 | 170998  | 146753  | 12273         | 10216   | <b>10196</b> | <b>10196</b> | <b>10196</b> | <b>10196</b>             | 10242      | 10222                    | <b>10196</b> | <b>10196</b> | <b>10196</b> |
| ER235     | 50  | 295   | 7700    | 6700    | 1141          | 3011    | 315          | 313          | <b>295</b>   | <b>295</b>               | 324        | 313                      | <b>295</b>   | 297          | 297          |
| ER466     | 80  |       | 48627   | 44255   | 19952         | 28994   | 1938         | 1993         | 1655         | 1542                     | 1874       | 1874                     | 1560         | 1548         | 1575         |
| ER941     | 140 |       | 234479  | 229576  | 114166        | 116135  | 8106         | 8419         | 5326         | 5198                     | 5724       | 5544                     | 5120         | 5345         | 5482         |
| ER2344    | 200 |       | 2011122 | 2009132 | 1606656       | 1395584 | 1118785      | 1112685      | 1059239      | 997839                   | 1066164    | 1038048                  | 1039254      | 1014430      | 1048464      |
| FF250     | 50  | 194   | 1841    | 1386    | 302           | 217     | 199          | 197          | <b>194</b>   | <b>194</b>               | 212        | 195                      | <b>194</b>   | <b>194</b>   | <b>194</b>   |
| FF500     | 110 | 257   | 2397    | 1904    | 344           | 293     | 262          | 264          | 259          | <b>257</b>               | 261        | 261                      | <b>257</b>   | <b>257</b>   | <b>257</b>   |
| FF1000    | 150 | 1260  | 92800   | 59594   | 1880          | 1414    | 1288         | 1271         | 1279         | <b>1260</b>              | 1278       | 1276                     | <b>1260</b>  | <b>1260</b>  | 1261         |
| FF2000    | 200 | 4545  | 387248  | 256905  | 7432          | 5002    | 4647         | 4592         | 4551         | 4549                     | 4583       | 4583                     | 4546         | 4548         | 4554         |
| WS250     | 70  |       | 14251   | 13786   | 16110         | 16110   | 11694        | 11401        | 7977         | 6610                     | 3266       | 3241                     | 3240         | 4465         | 9351         |
| WS500     | 125 |       | 54201   | 53779   | 55163         | 69751   | 4818         | 11981        | <b>2130</b>  | <b>2130</b>              | 2282       | 2282                     | 2199         | 2141         | 2209         |
| WS1000    | 200 |       | 311700  | 308596  | 319600        | 319600  | 316416       | 318003       | 236279       | 139653                   | 146172     | 115914                   | 113638       | 171635       | 297241       |
| WS1500    | 265 |       | 717369  | 703241  | 653015        | 761995  | 157621       | 243190       | 13792        | 13792                    | 16357      | 14681                    | 13662        | 14461        | 14177        |

Legend: bold font results represent the global optimum for the instance while yellow colour represents the best known heuristic result gathered so far. Note that such results are obtained running the algorithms with different time limits on different computers.

Set 1: proposed in Ventresca in Ventresca, M., 2012. Global search algorithms using a combinatorial unranking-based problem representation for the critical node detection problem. Computers & Operations Research 39, 2763–2775.

Set 1 is available here: <https://engineering.purdue.edu/~mventresca/cnd.zip>  
<http://di.unito.it/cnp>

results on set 2

| Instances            | K    | Greedy3d | Greedy4d | Best VNS | Best ILS | Genetic  |
|----------------------|------|----------|----------|----------|----------|----------|
| Bovine               | 3    | 268      | 268      | 268      | 268      | 268      |
| Circuit              | 25   | 2099     | 2100     | 2101     | 2117     | 2099     |
| E.coli               | 15   | 806      | 834      | 806      | 806      | 806      |
| USAir97              | 33   | 4442     | 4726     | 5444     | 4442     | 4336     |
| HumanDiseas          | 52   | 1115     | 1115     | 1115     | 1115     | 1115     |
| TreniRoma            | 26   | 926      | 936      | 920      | 934      | 928      |
| EU_flights           | 119  | 349927   | 350757   | 356631   | 355798   | 351610   |
| openflights          | 186  | 29624    | 29552    | 31620    | 29416    | 28834    |
| yeast                | 202  | 1416     | 1415     | 1421     | 1434     | 1414     |
| Ham1000              | 100  | 338574   | 336866   | 332286   | 344509   | 328817   |
| Ham2000              | 200  | 1372109  | 1367779  | 1309063  | 1417341  | 1315198  |
| Ham3000a             | 300  | 3087215  | 3100938  | 3058656  | 3278172  | 3005183  |
| Ham3000b             | 300  | 3096420  | 3100748  | 3121639  | 3250497  | 2993393  |
| Ham3000c             | 300  | 3094459  | 3097451  | 3079570  | 3202002  | 2975213  |
| Ham3000d             | 300  | 3090753  | 3100216  | 3027839  | 3237495  | 2988605  |
| Ham3000 <sup>e</sup> | 300  | 3095793  | 3113514  | 3031975  | 3255390  | 3001078  |
| Ham4000              | 400  | 5534254  | 5530402  | 5498097  | 5877896  | 5403572  |
| Ham5000              | 500  | 8657681  | 8653358  | 8889904  | 9212984  | 8411789  |
| powergrid            | 494  | 16373    | 16406    | 16099    | 16533    | 16254    |
| Oclinks              | 190  | 614504   | 614546   | 623366   | 625671   | 620020   |
| facebook             | 404  | 608487   | 856642   | 865115   | 420334   | 561111   |
| grqc                 | 524  | 13787    | 13825    | 13751    | 13817    | 13736    |
| hepth                | 988  | 232021   | 326281   | 114933   | 123138   | 114382   |
| hepph                | 1201 | 10305849 | 10162995 | 10989642 | 11759201 | 7336826  |
| astroph              | 1877 | 54713053 | 54517114 | 65937108 | 65822942 | 58045178 |
| condmat              | 2313 | 11771033 | 11758662 | 6121430  | 2298596  | 2612548  |

Legend: bold font results represent the global optimum for the instance while yellow colour represents the best known heuristic result gathered so far. Note that such results are obtained running the algorithms with different time limits on different computers.

Set 2: proposed in (partially) Addis, B., Aringhieri, R., Grosso, A., Hosteins, P., 2016. Hybrid Constructive Heuristics for the Critical Node Problem. Annals of Operations Research 238 (1), 637–649

and in

Aringhieri, R., Grosso, A., Hosteins, P., Scatamacchia, R., 2016. A general evolutionary framework for different classes of critical node problems. Engineering Applications of Artificial Intelligence, 55:128-145.

Set 2 is available here: <http://di.unito.it/cnp>